

Special Meeting of the Great Lakes Gulf Presbytery,

Meeting on October 23, 2020, at 1:00 p.m.,

At Southside, Indianapolis, Reformed Presbyterian Church.

The Great Lakes-Gulf Presbytery assembled at 1:00 p.m. on October 23, 2020 at the Southside Reformed Presbyterian Church for a special meeting called by the moderator¹ for “the consideration of the Ad Interim minutes & actions up until that day, Communications 20-06 through 20-10, and any other pertinent items related to the disposition of Mr. LeFebvre's credentials and the November 13 and 14 scheduled trial meeting.”

The Moderator, David Hanson, called the meeting to order at 1:02 PM.

The Moderator read Deut. 17: 8-20.

The Moderator led in prayer and constituted the court.

Roll: Roll call by the Assistant Clerk, Dale Koons, as follows:

¹ Moderator's Edict (10/13/20): Brothers, As moderator, I am calling a Great-Lakes Gulf Presbytery Meeting for October 23rd, 2020 to convene at 1 p.m. at Southside R.P. Indianapolis. The specified business for this meeting is the consideration of the Ad Interim minutes & actions up until that day, Communications 20-06 through 20-10, and any other pertinent items related to the disposition of Mr. LeFebvre's credentials and the November 13 and 14 scheduled trial meeting. DoCG 6.4 "A Presbytery may arrange special meetings. The moderator may, at his own discretion, or upon the request of two members, call a meeting to transact business requiring immediate attention. At least ten days' notice shall be given, and the call shall specify the business to be considered. The first decision after the organization of the court shall be on the question of sustaining the action of the moderator in calling the meeting. The presbytery shall consider only the business specified, other items may be introduced by a two-thirds vote." The rationale for this meeting is that in my judgment we are not prepared and settled enough for our next meeting to be the beginning of a trial. There are several undealt with communications that are complex and lengthy, there are actions of the Ad Interim Commission that have been called into question, and there are other trial preparation issues to work through. To summon witnesses to appear at a meeting at which hours may be spent untangling the past month is an unfair burden to the witnesses. Also, just for your understanding, I communicated to the AIC Moderator, Mr. Butterfield last Thursday that if they moved the trial date that I would take this action of calling a special meeting. Because the AIC's actions are being questioned, they aren't in the best position to request a meeting like this for a review of their own actions, so I am acting. Once again, the responsibility for this action is mine alone, so you know who to blame. In Christ, David Hanson. October 13, 2020

Certified Delegates and Alternates for
2020 Great Lakes-Gulf Presbytery
Special Meeting, October 23, 2020

			ATTENDANCE			
			Certifications	Status	Notes	Roll Call
Church	First	Last Name	Certified			
Atlanta Presbyterian Fellowship	Frank J.	Smith	Spring	TE	Excused*	
Belle Center RPC	Philip	Pockras	Spring	TE		P
Belle Center RPC- Provisional	Scott	Hunt	Spring	RE	Excused*	
Bloomington RPC	Richard	Holdeman	Spring	TE		P
Bloomington RPC	Phillip	McCollum	Spring	TE		P
Bloomington RPC	Kenneth	De Jong				
Bloomington RPC	Wes	Archer				
Bloomington RPC	C.J.	Davis				P
Bloomington RPC	Stephen	Shipp	Spring	RE		
Bloomington RPC	Eric	Cosens	Spring	RE		
Bloomington RPC	Wendell	McBurney				
Christ Church RP	Jason	O'Neill	Spring	ALT		
Christ Church RP	Dale	Koons	Spring	RE		P
Christ Church RP	Sean	Bird	Spring	RE		P
Christ Church RP	Andrew	Falk	Spring	ALT		
Christ Church RP	Duane	Judd				
Columbus RPC	Gary	McNamee	Spring	RE		P
Columbus RPC	Jeffrey	Jones	Fall	RE		P
Columbus RPC	Ed	Schisler	Spring	RE		
Columbus RPC	David	Schisler				
Durham First RPC	Kent	Butterfield	Spring	TE		P
Durham First RPC -Provisional	Robert	Bibby	Fall	RE	Lafayette	
Elkhart RPC	Wade	Mann	Spring	TE		P
Elkhart RPC	Fikre	Menbere	Spring	RE		

Elkhart RPC	Jonathan Ummel	Spring	ALT		
Elkhart RPC	Andy DeRosa	Spring	ALT		
Grand Rapids First RPC	Craig Scott	Spring	TE	Excused*	
Grand Rapids First RPC	Jake Schwartz	Spring	RE	ZOOM	P
Hetherton RPC	Ray Morton	Spring	TE		P
Hetherton RPC	Barton Briley	*	RE		
Immanuel RPC, West Lafayette	Jared Olivetti	Spring	TE		P
Immanuel RPC, West Lafayette	David Carr	Fall	RE		P
Immanuel RPC, West Lafayette	Benjamin Larson	Spring	ALT		
Immanuel RPC, West Lafayette	Keith Magill		*	See Retired	
Immanuel RPC, West Lafayette	Nate Pfeiffer	10/16/20	RE		P
Immanuel RPC, West Lafayette	Zachary Blackwood	Spring	ALT		
Immanuel RPC, West Lafayette	Sergei Spirydovich				
Lafayette RPC	Adam Niess	Spring	TE	ZOOM	P
Lafayette RPC	Ken Nelson	Spring	ALT		
Lafayette RPC	Robert Bibby	Spring	RE	ZOOM	P
Lafayette RPC	Jeff Kessler	Spring	RE	Excused*	
Lafayette RPC	Chris Stockwell	Fall	RE	ZOOM	P
Lafayette RPC	Dan Webb				
Marion RPC	Jason Camery	Spring	TE		P
Marion RPC	Greg Fisher	Spring	RE		P
Marion RPC	Scott Hunt	Spring		Excused*	
Orlando RPC	Jonathon Schaefer	Spring	RE	Excused*	
Orlando RPC	James Pennington				
Orlando RPC	Joe Worsham				
Second RPC, Indianapolis	James Faris	Spring		EXCUSED	
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Joel Hart	Spring	TE	ZOOM	P
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Russ Pulliam	Spring	ALT		
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Richard Blankenship	Spring	RE		
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Richard Blum	Spring	ALT		
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Donald Cassell, Jr				
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Dean Filson		RE		
Second RPC, Indianapolis	David Mauser				

Second RPC, Indianapolis	Terry Magnuson	Spring	ALT		P
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Jeff Platt	Spring	ALT		
Second RPC, Indianapolis	David Pulliam	Fall		ZOOM	P
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Karl Stoicheff				
Second RPC, Indianapolis	Walt Zebrun				
Selma RPC, Alabama	George Evans				
Selma RPC, Alabama	Averette Woodson	Spring	RE	Excused*	
Selma RPC, Alabama	Greg Woodson	Spring	RE	Excused*	
Southfield RPC, Michigan	Adam Kuehner	Spring	TE		P
Southfield RPC, Michigan	Jon Hughes	Spring	RE		P
Southfield RPC, Michigan	John Kim				
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	David Hanson	Spring	TE		P
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	Ian Wise	Spring	TE		P
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	Steve Sturm				
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	Ross Cerbus				
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	John Hanson	Spring	RE		P
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	Mark Hart	Spring	RE		P
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	David Kleyn				
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	Jerry Porter				
Southside RPC, Indianapolis	Don Prichard				
Southwest Ohio RPC, Mason, Ohio	Dick Knodel, Jr.	Spring	TE		P
Southwest Ohio RPC, Mason, Ohio	Timothy Vincze	Spring	RE		P
Southwest Ohio RPC, Mason, Ohio	Greg Damerow	Spring	ALT		
Sparta RPC	James Odom	Spring	RE		P
Sparta RPC	Jim McMahan				
Sycamore RPC, Kokomo	Shawn Anderson	Spring	RE		P
Sycamore RPC, Kokomo	Robert McKissick	Spring	RE		
Sycamore RPC, Kokomo	Tom Dinkledine				
Terre Haute RPC	Steve Rhoda	Spring	TE		P
Terre Haute RPC	Russell Lodge	Spring	RE		
Terre Haute RPC	Josh Reshey	Fall	RE		

Westminster RPC, Prairie View, IL						
Westminster RPC, Prairie View, IL	Robert Koch	Spring	RE			
Westminster RPC, Prairie View, IL	Jim Ritchhart					
Ministers, Retired	Godfrey Franklin					
Ministers, Retired	Richard Johnston			ZOOM		P
Ministers, Retired	Gordon Keddie					
Ministers, Retired	Ray Lanning	Fall	TE			
Ministers, Retired	Keith Magill	Spring	TE			P
Ministers, Retired	Paul Matthews					
Ministers, Retired	Robert McCracken					
Ministers, Retired	Glenn McFarland					
Ministers, Retired	James McMahan					
Ministers, Retired	Robert Morrow					
Ministers, Retired	James Pennington	Fall	TE			
Ministers, Retired	Dennis Prutow					
Ministers, Retired	Frank Schutz	Fall	TE			
Ministers, Retired	Steven Work	Spring	TE			P
Ministers, Retired	James Wright					
Ministers, in Synod Service	Keith Evans	Spring	TE			P
Ministers, in Synod Service	Michael LeFebvre	Spring	TE			
Ministers, Presbytery Missionary	Zachry Smith	Fall	TE			
Ministers, in Synod Service	David Whitla	Spring	TE			P
			ZOOM			
* Status per email from Adam Kuehner on October 22 at 11:51 PM				Attendance	39	
			Teaching Elders	26	57	
			Ruling Elders	31	7	
			Alternates	12		

The Assistant Clerk announced that a quorum was present.

The Moderator sought that his call of this meeting be sustained (DCG 7.4 on D-31).

A point of order was submitted in writing, stating that “The motion to ratify the moderator’s edict is out of order, being an improper motion, in that it conflicts

with a motion previously adopted by the court, thereby requiring a *Motion to Rescind*, which cannot be moved prior to the ratification of the meeting”; after which the moderator ruled against the point of order and was upheld in his decision by a vote of 19-11.

The following delegates indicated their intent to file a complaint to synod: Shawn Anderson, Phil Pockras, Adam Kuehner, Dick Knodel.

Motion: moved, seconded and passed that the call of this meeting by the Moderator is sustained.

The following recorded a dissent from this action: Phil Pockras and Dick Knodel.

Motion: moved, seconded and passed that the moderator’s proposal² for the use of Zoom communication is agreed for today for:

Rich Johnston, Adam Niess, Bob Bibby, Chris Stockwell, Joel Hart, David Pulliam, and Jake Schwartz.

Motion: moved, seconded and passed to certify and seat Terry Magnuson as a ruling elder delegate from Second RPC of Indianapolis.

² Moderator’s Email (10/23/20): Here is what I am proposing: **(1)** A Zoom link will be made available only to elder delegates staying away for Covid related reasons. [Rationale: 1) Other sicknesses have kept presbyters away for years and are just part of God’s providence, and we haven’t and will continue to not allow those men to video in. However, in this case we are dealing with men who have no symptoms but are choosing to protect the court by staying away. Therefore, since they are loving their neighbor as themselves via their absence, we will attempt to love them as ourselves by including them. 2) We are not seeking to C-Span this event! It will only be made available to certified delegates.] **(2)** Zoom delegates will have privileges of the floor, but will not have "last-second" privileges of the floor. [Rationale: If the moderator is getting ready to call a vote, and a delegate in row 10 wants to make a speech, he is able to wave his hand and get my attention at the last second. It is too cumbersome to require checking the Zoom feed to make sure no one on Zoom is seeking the floor. So, if the Zoom delegates want to speak, they will need to give indication early in the discussion.] **(3)** If Zoom freezes up, the presbytery will proceed as usual. It will be as if those men stepped out of the room voluntarily to get a cup of coffee or something. When Zoom unfreezes, it will be as if they reentered the room. **(4)** Voting: Zoom delegates will only vote when there is a division or roll call vote. [Rationale: The electronic feed may slightly delay the timing of their responses, and the amplification + or - may not accurately convey the actual votes. Limiting their participation in voice votes while permitting participation in division votes should preserve their right to vote on the more controversial matters while allowing the court to proceed smoothly and fairly on the more clear votes.] **(5)** Monitoring of the system: (Not the Moderator!) There will be two technology clerks to monitor Zoom both to report when someone is seeking the floor and to inform the clerks of the Zoom vote counts in cases of division. They will also be responsible for keeping the feed live. **Authorization:** This is a proposal. At the time of the roll call: 1) The roll of those in the room will be called. 2) The moderator’s calling of the meeting will be sustained/not sustained. 3) I will then rule that this Zoom plan is legal participation/attendance. This ruling can then be challenged to the full court, if you deem it to be unconstitutional or unfair. All or individual parts of it can be challenged. 4) If this plan is sustained, we will then add those on Zoom to the roll by calling their names. **Participation:** Those wishing to participate in this way need to inform me, by noon if at all possible, stating your desire and your Covid reason. Provided that you qualify, we will send you the link and you will be able to join in. You will need to be present when the roll call is taken in order to be considered a voting delegate for this meeting.

Clerk's Report: Raymond Morton, Clerk pro tem.

a. Listing of the communications as received:

(The text of these communications is in the Addendum)

Communication 20-06B from Roel Ophof, RE from Los Angeles congregation in support of Mr. LeFebvre.

Communication 20-07 a review of AIC Actions from the Defense, Mr. Chellis.

Communication 20-08 Rebuttal Brief from the Prosecution;

Communication 20-09 Michael Lefebvre letter to the AIC with his concerns.

Communication 20-10 addressing certain aspects of the defendant's latest communication, 20-09.

Communication 20-11 An alternate way for the Presbytery to move forward regarding Michael LeFebvre.

Motion: Moved, seconded, and passed, that Communication 20-11 be taken up immediately after the Clerk's Report and the approval of this agenda.

- b. That the **parliamentarians** for this meeting are Jared Olivetti and Keith Evans.
- c. **Motion:** moved, seconded and passed that the Presbytery grant all RPCNA elders present, including all non-certified delegates from this Presbytery, the privilege of the floor during the remainder of this meeting.
- d. **Ad Interim Report**
- e. **Reading of the Minutes.**
- f. **Prayer of Adjournment.**

Motion: moved, seconded, and passed that Presbytery adopt the proposed agenda for this meeting.

The Clerks Report was received.

Recess: The Moderator announced recess from 2:20 to 2:30.

Communication 20-11 was taken up.

Item 1: That Mr. LeFebvre be given his credentials (with the pending charges attached) in order to transfer to another denomination.

A point of order was submitted in writing, claiming that "The motion to grant Mr. LeFebvre his credentials conflicts with multiple previous actions of this court, thereby requiring a Motion to Rescind those actions, which can only be adopted by a two-thirds

majority of this assembly, or the equivalent of a simple majority of the entire membership of the court (33/64)”; after which the moderator ruled against the point of order, noting that it contradicts DCG 9.11 (D-46).

Another point of order was submitted in writing, claiming that “The motion to grant Mr. LeFebvre his credentials is out of order, in that it violates the RPCNA Constitution by failing to specify the specific ecclesiastical body with which Mr. LeFebvre plans to affiliate”; after which the moderator ruled against the point of order and his decision was challenged.

Following debate the Moderator was sustained on a 21 to 17 vote.

The following indicated their intent to file a complaint to synod: Adam Kuehner, Shawn Anderson, Steven Work, Kent Butterfield, and Dick Knodel.³

Amendment: Motion: moved, seconded, and passed “That presbytery amend Motion #1 by adding the words ‘thereby removing him from the RPCNA.’”

Motion: moved, seconded, and passed to call the question.

The motion “That Mr. LeFebvre be given his credentials (with the pending charges attached) in order to transfer to another denomination, thereby removing him from the jurisdiction of the RPCNA” passed 20-18.

The following registered their dissent: Phil Pockras, Kent Butterfield, Greg Fisher, Jon Hughes, Jason Camery, Keith Evans, Shawn Anderson, Adam Kuehner, David Whitla, Dick Knodel, Steve Work, Bob Bibby, Jake Schwartz.

The following indicated their intent to file a complaint to synod: Shawn Anderson, Adam Kuehner, Jake Schwartz, Kent Butterfield, and Dick Knodel.⁴

The Following are the written dissents:

From Adam Kuehner:

I hereby request that my dissent at yesterday’s meeting of presbytery (regarding Motion 1 of communication 20-11) include the following rationale:

Ministers are officers of the church and men under authority (DCG 6:2; 6:13). How can a man be regarded as a credentialed church officer if he is no longer a member of (or a recognized officer in) any specific branch of the visible church? By giving Mr. LeFebvre’s credentials to himself (rather than to a specified ecclesiastical body), we have violated our constitution (DCG 6:2; 6:13) and strayed from Scriptural ecclesiology (2 Cor. 8:23).

Still worse, this action short-circuits the Biblical process of church discipline (Lev. 19:17; Matt. 18:15-18; 1 Tim. 5:19-22) which is a dynamic, Spirit-blessed means of grace “to

³ Robert McKissick, who did not attend the meeting, filed his complaint with the clerk pro tem on 11/21/20.

⁴ Robert McKissick, who did not attend the meeting, filed his complaint with the clerk pro tem on 11/21/20.

reclaim a sinning member, to deter others from similar offenses, to maintain the honor of Christ and the purity and peace of His Church, to maintain the truth of the gospel, and to avoid the wrath of God coming upon the church” (BOD 1:3).

Therefore, while I appreciate the noble intentions of the brothers who voted to pass this motion, I must register my dissent in hope that the Lord will be patient and merciful to further sanctify us in the truth of His word. Otherwise, I fear that “A church which does not follow our Lord’s commands regarding church discipline will certainly lose His blessing, deteriorating more and more in doctrine and life” (BOD 1:4).

Blessings,
Adam K.

From Shawn Anderson:

There are charges of alleged censurable sin against Mr. Lefebvre. The right and just thing to do is to adjudicate those charges, finding Mr. Lefebvre guilty or innocent. While these charges were filed by two men against Mr. Lefebvre’s published works, there was already a request by the St. Lawrence Presbytery to investigate whether these writings were consistent with our subordinate standards, a paper detailing the specific concerns from a session within our presbytery, a record of deep concern and criticism from the faculty of our seminary, a presbytery committee that studied these writings and found that the content was out of accord with our standards, not to mention Mr. Lefebvre’s own admission that his writings were contrary to our standards in at least one area. The allegations are not over young earth versus old earth, but concerning a fundamental doctrine of the Gospel, the denial of the necessity of Adam being our first parent and the root of mankind.

The judicial process was enacted by this presbytery, yet this same presbytery has never stated that Mr. Lefebvre has violated his vows; those charges have been formally left unanswered – but not informally. Mr. Lefebvre has never admitted or confessed that he is guilty of the alleged charges against him. He maintains his innocence, yet there have been attempts to admonish him, to exhort, to rebuke, to call to repentance, to warn – all without going through the process of contesting these charges. Instead of holding Mr. Lefebvre accountable to the charges and encouraging him to confess or contest, the simple majority of this court has prejudged the case. It has concluded that it is less costly to make Mr. Lefebvre a “free agent” minister rather than spend the time and resources for a trial.

Further, this court has abandoned the Biblical means of dealing with accusations of guilt in this case. Instead of seeking to lead him in repentance and restoration if guilty, or exoneration and vindication if innocent, they have allowed Mr. Lefebvre to pursue his own course. They have received an accusation against Mr. Lefebvre, and under the pretense of love, they are willing to attach these allegations to his credentials instead of dealing with them. Leviticus 19:17 ‘You shall not hate your brother in your heart. You shall surely rebuke your neighbor, and not bear sin because of him.

This is not honoring to Christ, nor loving toward Mr. Lefebvre, nor maintaining the peace and purity of Christ's Church, nor protecting the truth of the Gospel, nor avoiding the discipline of the Lord coming upon the Church (BoD 1.3). Therefore, I dissent from this action. May the Lord grant us forgiveness and repentance.

Thank you for your service,
-Shawn Anderson

From Keith Evans:

As notified at yesterday's presbytery meeting, and for inclusion in the minutes, please find attached my formal statement of dissent in relation to adoption of Motion 1 of Communication 20-11.

I would like my registered dissent at yesterday's meeting of presbytery regarding Motion 1 of communication 20-11 to include the following rationale:

"By failing to move forward with the properly ordered disciplinary proceedings, unconstitutionally giving Mr. LeFebvre his credentials without an ecclesiastical destination, and dismissing him from the RPCNA, we have grievously deprived our erring brother of Christ's effectual means of grace: church discipline. We have therefore failed to love our brother, functionally disregarded the blessing of discipline, and allowed unresolved charges to hang over Mr. LeFebvre's head without properly adjudicating the accusations. We have done a great disservice in this action to Mr. LeFebvre, Christ's church, and the honor of Christ himself, and I hereby record my dissent." Keith Evans

From David Whitla:

**Dissent to Action of GLG Presbytery
re. Communication 20-11, Motion 1**

October 23, 2020

I respectfully request my dissent to be registered to this action of presbytery for the following reasons: It suspends presbytery's already-initiated actions of judicial process without proper rescindment, leaving serious charges against Mr. Lefebvre unresolved. Our Book of Discipline reminds us that, "The purpose of Christian discipline is to bring about a redemptive change" (BD, *Intro* [E-1]). This action has deprived Mr. Lefebvre of this means of grace, and thus the opportunity for repentance and restoration to useful service in our midst, to his and our great loss.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. David G. Whitla

Registered Complaints:

Robert McKissick - Registered Complaint against motions at GLGP meeting Oct 23, 2020⁵

1) the sustained motion to uphold the moderator's ruling that the proposed motion granting Dr. Lefebvre's credentials to himself rather than to a receiving denomination

2) the sustained motion that Mr Lefebvre be given his credentials (with pending charges attached) in order to transfer to another denomination, thereby removing him from the jurisdiction of the RPCNA.

Recess: the Moderator announced recess from 3:45 to 3:55.

Item 2: That the November 13-14 trial date be cancelled.

Motion: moved, seconded and passed that the trial date be cancelled.

The following registered their dissent: Jon Hughes, Steven Work, Jake Schwartz.

Motion: moved and seconded that the meeting be adjourned. The motion failed.

Item 3: That communications 20-6 to 20-10 be referred to a judicial committee (appointed by the moderator) to report back at the spring meeting.

Item 3 was voted down.

Item 4: That Mr. LeFebvre be counseled to have his identification as a pastor in the RPCNA and adjunct professor at RPTS be removed, insofar as possible, from his publications concerning the issues found in these charges.

The item was debated and subsequently passed.

Item 5: That the Great Lakes-Gulf Presbytery reaffirm its commitment to RP Testimony 4.4 and exhort Mr. LeFebvre to turn away from his unbiblical exception to it.

Amendment: **Motion:** moved, seconded and passed "That presbytery amend Motion #5 by adding the words 'and inform him that he ought to have declared his exception to the presbytery before publishing his views.'"

Motion: moved, seconded and passed Item 5 by a count of 20 to 14.

Motion: moved, seconded and passed that this meeting be extended by 30 minutes.

Jared Olivetti introduced the following motion:

⁵ Mr. McKissick did not attend the meeting, but, upon hearing of the decision, registered his complaint with the clerk pro tem on November 21, 2020.

“Whereas God has used Pastor Michael Lefebvre in many and wonderful ways to bless our presbytery and denomination and to make the RPCNA a blessing to the bride of Jesus throughout the world;

“Whereas God has blessed Pastor Lefebvre’s church planting and pastoring of Christ Church Reformed Presbyterian;

“Whereas God has uniquely gifted our brother’s academic and writing abilities to our great benefit, including the areas of Psalmody, ministering to those struggling with gender issues and same-sex attraction, and our understanding of God’s law in the Old Testament be it;

It is moved that presbytery rise to express our profound gratitude to Pastor Lefebvre for his ministry and labors among us, our love for him as our friend and co-laborer, our sorrow at his departure, and that presbytery pray for God’s blessing on his future endeavors to serve Jesus.”

The motion was seconded, after which it was debated and passed.
Pastor Philip McCollum led the Court in prayer.

Minutes:

The Clerk read the Minutes of this meeting.

The Minutes were adopted.

Motion: moved, seconded and passed that Presbytery adjourn.

Pastor Phil Pockras led the prayer of adjournment.

The Presbytery adjourned at 5:35 p.m.

David Hanson, Moderator

Raymond Morton, Clerk, pro tem